



Original: English
October 2002

REPORT OF THE MEETING OF THE OIE WORKING GROUP ON ANIMAL WELFARE

Paris, 16-18 October 2002

**(Extract from the November-December 2002 meeting of the
OIE International Animal Health Code Commission)**

The OIE Working Group on Animal Welfare held its first meeting at the OIE Headquarters from 16-18 October 2002.

The members of the OIE Working Group and other participants are listed in [Appendix I](#). The Agenda adopted is given in [Appendix II](#). Dr D. Bayvel was appointed chairman of the Working Group.

The Director General of the OIE, Dr B. Vallat, welcomed the members of the Working Group and thanked them for agreeing to participate in this important task. He noted that Dr I.M. Reda could not be present due to illness and Dr T. Hastein due to a previous commitment in Rome.

The Director General then discussed with the members the context in which they were to operate: he reminded them that their work flowed from the resolution on animal welfare adopted by the OIE International Committee in May and noted that theirs was the first permanent OIE Working Group dealing with OIE standards. Accordingly, he indicated that output from the Working Group in the form of principles and policies initially, and standards in due course, would go to the Code Commission for endorsement and then to the International Committee for discussion and adoption. As well, he said, the Working Group has the opportunity to influence the deliberations of the International Committee through its presentation during each General Session.

Dr Vallat saw the principal immediate tasks of the Working Group as the drafting of a paper on 'policies and principles' which would act as an indicative precursor to standards, and drawing up a work programme for 2003 based on the priorities identified by the International Committee, utilising *Ad hoc* Groups and individual experts as appropriate. The priorities identified were, firstly, transport, humane slaughter and killing for disease control and, secondly, housing and management.

Dr Vallat also indicated the importance of the OIE working effectively with non-governmental organisations (NGOs) to improve the quality and transparency of its work, and asked the Working Group to advise the OIE on how this could best be achieved.

Appendix XXII (contd)

Members discussed relevant activities:

- 1) the upcoming EC Communication on animal welfare - moving away from animal welfare as a trade barrier and emphasising animal welfare as a part of the cultural development of regions;
- 2) in the USA, the significant changes driven by the large retailer chains and the need for the OIE to tap into and influence this, while acknowledging the short time frames in which these companies have to work;
- 3) the large number of small NGOs in Africa, of varying influence;
- 4) upcoming conferences – New Zealand Veterinary Association / Commonwealth Veterinary Association in Wellington, Universities Federation for Animal Welfare (UFAW) in Edinburgh, World Society for the Protection of Animals (WSPA) in Bangalore and the Manila Ministerial conference.

Guiding principles and policies

In the recommendations developed by the *Ad hoc* Group in April 2002, and in Resolution No XIV adopted at the 70th OIE General Session, considerable emphasis was placed on the early development of an agreed set of guiding principles and policies to underpin, guide and provide a strategic and operational framework for the OIE's work in animal welfare, prior to any drafting of individual standards. These principles and policies will ensure that the nature and extent of the OIE animal welfare role are clearly understood both inside and outside the organisation.

A draft mission statement, and draft statements on guiding principles and policies were agreed (Appendix III).

Use of external expertise

Recognising the importance of OIE being transparent in its policy development, the Working Group discussed the best methods of working with NGOs to the benefit of all parties. It proposed a conference be held with NGOs (including industry groups, recalling that many interested parties lie within the animal production side) to explain OIE's strategy and work, and to seek NGOs' proposals on how they could organise themselves into areas of interest to work with the OIE. The NGOs would be asked to contribute papers and policy statements. The conference, to be held in the second half of 2003, would have the benefit of exposing OIE's work to the maximum number of stakeholders. Dr Gavinelli would take the lead in providing information and details concerning the EU experience on this issue. The next meeting of the Working Group would be held in conjunction with the conference.

At its recent meeting, the OIE's European Regional Commission had proposed that centres of expertise be used rather than individual experts, but the Working Group recognised a need to include on some occasions expertise outside such centres. The Working Group agreed to try to develop a database of expert centres for the priority subjects, based on members' knowledge of their regions. Once this database was drawn up, the OIE would write formally to these centres, through the OIE Delegates, advising of the OIE's strategy and seeking their availability and willingness to assist the OIE on particular issues. Concurrently, Delegates and Regional Representatives would be asked to make additional nominations in the identified priority areas. A list of registered centres of expertise would be placed on the OIE Web page.

The Working Group recommended that a stakeholder database also be developed to maximise communications efficiency.

Modus operandi

The Working Group discussed the advantages and disadvantages of a member of the Working Group participating in meetings of each *Ad hoc* Group set up to work on a specific animal welfare issue. It decided that the OIE would be better served by Working Group members remaining independent of *Ad hoc* Groups, with the Working Group influencing the work of *Ad hoc* Groups through determining their membership and terms of

Appendix XXII (contd)

reference, and acting in an oversight/review role. It recommended that, instead, a member of the Working Group be a point of reference for each *Ad hoc* Group. The Working Group recommended that the output of *Ad hoc* Groups be circulated electronically for Working Group member comment and agreement, before being placed on the agenda for the next meeting of the Code Commission. Subject to endorsement by the Code Commission, the output would be included in its report to Member Countries.

Recognising the sensitive issues involved in the development of standards but also that OIE will need to make progress in that direction, the Working Group recommended that *Ad hoc* Groups initially develop more detailed statements on policies and principles, specific to their subject, as a bridge between the generic OIE statement on policies and principles, and future specific animal welfare standards.

The members of the Working Group recommended that their terms of membership be staggered initially to allow for an organised retention of expertise, but also to introduce new skills and perspectives in a managed fashion.

The members recommended that OIE set aside a separate public page on its Web site for animal welfare, and also a private page for members' use in circulating and commenting on draft documents. The OIE animal welfare Web page should include information on Working Group membership and short biographies of members.

Animals and biotechnology

The Working Group recommended that OIE become involved in the area of animal biotechnology, that is with regard to the animal welfare mandate, 'all breeding technologies including cloning'. Members of the Working Group would identify an expert for OIE to ask to write a background document. The report of the Agriculture and Environment Biotechnology Commission (AEBC) on 'animals and biotechnology' (http://www.aebc.gov.uk/aebc/animals_report.html) report was seen as relevant.

Work programme

The Working Group developed a work programme for 2003 (Appendix IV), addressing the following issues:

- 1) a statement of mission, guiding principles and policies for adoption by the International Committee in 2003;
- 2) development of expertise and stakeholder database;
- 3) animal welfare conference - second half of 2003;
- 4) terms of reference, scope and membership of *Ad hoc* Groups, with possible meetings of two *Ad hoc* Groups in the first half of 2003;
- 5) increasing awareness of animal welfare in undergraduate teaching;
- 6) increasing awareness of animal welfare research needs and funding requirements;
- 7) promoting collaboration among academic and research institutions;
- 8) communications plan addressing both internal and external audiences;
- 9) identification of future activities and emerging issues.

The Working Group revised the scope, drafted terms of reference, and identified potential members for four separate *Ad hoc* Groups covering land transport, sea transport, humane slaughter (including a subgroup for religious slaughter) and killing for disease control (Appendix V). The Working Group also recommended that the OIE continue to work with International Air Transport Association (IATA) and Animal Transportation Association (AATA) on air transportation issues.

**MEETING OF THE OIE
WORKING GROUP ON ANIMAL WELFARE**

Paris, 16-18 October 2002

List of participants

MEMBERS OF THE OIE WORKING GROUP

Dr David Bayvel

Director Animal Welfare
MAF Biosecurity Authority
Box 2526
Wellington
NEW ZEALAND
Tel.: (64-4) 4744251
Fax: (64-4) 4989888
E-mail: bayveld@maf.govt.nz

Dr David Fraser

Professor and Chair in Animal Welfare
Faculty of Agricultural Sciences and
Centre for Applied Ethics
University of British Columbia
2357 Main Mall-Suite 248
Vancouver V6T 1Z4
CANADA
Tel.: (1-604) 822 2040
Fax.: (1-604) 822 4400
E-mail: fraserd@interchg.ubc.ca

Dr Andrea Gavinelli

Administrator
European Commission Directorate General
Health and Consumer Protection
Unit E2 – Animal Health and Welfare,
Zootechnics
Rue Froissart 101 – 2/54
1040 Brussels
BELGIUM
Tel.: (32-2) 2966426
Fax: (32-2) 2953144
E-mail: Andrea.Gavinelli@cec.eu.int

Dr Walter N. Masiga

Box 47926
Nairobi
KENYA
E-mail: masiga@iconnect.co.ke

Prof Dr Ismail M. Reda (absent)

Faculty of Veterinary Medicine
University of Cairo
GIZA (12211)
Cairo
EGYPT
Tel.: (20 2) 571 03 09
Fax: (20 2) 572 52 40
E-mail: imreda@yahoo.com

Dr Sira Abdul Rahman

Retd. Dean Bangalore Veterinary College
No 123, 7th B Main Road
4th Block(West)
Jayanagar, Bangalore 560 011
INDIA
Tel.: (91-80) 6532168
Fax: (91-80) 6635210
E-mail: shireen@blr.vsnl.net.in

OTHER PARTICIPANTS

Dr. A. Thiermann

*President of the OIE International
Animal Health Code Commission*
US Mission to the Organisation for
Economic Co-operation and Development
19, rue de Franqueville
75016 Paris
FRANCE
Tel: 33-(0)1 44 15 18 69
Fax: 33-(0)1 42 67 09 87
E-mail: alexthiermann@compuserve.com

Professor T. Hastein (absent)

*President of the OIE Fish Diseases
Commission*

OIE HEADQUARTERS

Dr B. Vallat

Director General
12, rue de Prony
75017 Paris
FRANCE
Tel: 33 - (0)1 44 15 18 88
Fax: 33 - (0)1 42 67 09 87
E-mail: oie@oie.int

Dr D. Wilson

Head
International Trade Department
OIE
Tel.: 33 (0)1 44.15.18.80
Fax: 33 (0)1 42.67.09.87
E-mail: d.wilson@oie.int

Dr H. Kamakawa

Chargé de mission
International Trade Department
Tel.: 33 (0)1 44.15.18.92
Fax: 33 (0)1 42.67.09.87
E-mail: h.kamakawa@oie.int

**MEETING OF THE OIE
WORKING GROUP ON ANIMAL WELFARE**

Paris, 16-18 October 2002

Agenda

1. Introduction

- discussion at OIE General Session
- other discussions

2. Working Group Member Update: Activities since last meeting

3. Draft Statement of Mission and Vision

4. Draft Statement of Policies and Principles

5. Working Group *Modus Operandi*

- the scope of the OIE involvement in the animal welfare issues
- relationship with NGOs and industry groups
- use of external expertise
 - organisations
 - individual experts

6. Operational Plan for 2003: Priorities and resources

7. Communications Plan

8. Other Business

9. Agreed Actions

10. Next meeting

STATEMENTS OF MISSION, GUIDING PRINCIPLES AND POLICIES**1) OIE Mission**

To provide international leadership in animal welfare through the development of science-based standards and guidelines, the provision of expert advice and the promotion of relevant education and research. The OIE will achieve this mission through:

- a) promotion of science-based understanding of animal welfare
- b) utilisation of appropriate expertise
- c) consultation with relevant stakeholders
- d) recognition of regional and cultural dimensions
- e) liaison with academic and research institutions
- f) use of communication tools appropriate to all relevant audiences.

2) Guiding principles for animal welfare

- a) That there is a critical relationship between animal health and animal welfare.
- b) That the internationally recognised ‘five freedoms’ (freedom from hunger, thirst and malnutrition; freedom from fear and distress; freedom from physical and thermal discomfort; freedom from pain, injury and disease; and freedom to express normal patterns of behaviour) provide valuable guidance in animal welfare.
- c) That the internationally recognised ‘three Rs’ (reduction in numbers of animals, refinement of experimental methods and replacement of animals with non-animal techniques) provide valuable guidance for the use of animals in science.
- d) That the scientific assessment of animal welfare involves diverse elements which need to be considered together, and that selecting and weighing these elements often involves value-based assumptions which should be made as explicit as possible.
- e) That the use of animals in agriculture and science, and for companionship, recreation and entertainment, makes a major contribution to the wellbeing of people.
- f) That the use of animals carries with it a duty to ensure the welfare of such animals to the greatest extent practicable.
- g) That improvements in farm animal welfare can often improve productivity and hence lead to economic benefits.
- h) That equivalent outcomes (performance criteria), rather than identical systems (design criteria), be the basis for comparison of animal welfare standards and guidelines.

Appendix XXII (contd)Appendix III (contd)**3) Policies**

In undertaking its animal welfare role, the OIE seeks to adhere to the following policies:

- a) That it will make appropriate use of international scientific expertise in the development of animal welfare guidelines and standards.
 - b) That, in addition to the use of established consultation processes, OIE will consult with NGO and industry stakeholder interests which can demonstrate a broad-based approach to the issues.
 - c) That it will encourage the teaching of animal welfare and animal ethics in veterinary and other undergraduate curricula around the world.
 - d) That it will encourage the identification of animal welfare research needs and the provision of public and private sector funds to address these needs.
 - e) That it will encourage science-based methods to assess animal welfare outcomes.
 - f) That OIE's initial priorities for animal welfare will be animals in agriculture and aquaculture particularly relating to transport, humane slaughter, and killing for disease control.
 - g) That it will take into account regional and cultural dimensions.
 - h) That it will use communication tools appropriate to audiences.
-

ANIMAL WELFARE WORKING GROUP WORK PROGRAMME

Mission, guiding principles and policies	OIE process for adoption by International Committee	Working Group members to comment within 4 weeks, then OIE to include in Code Commission report
Standards and guidelines	Proposed order of work 1. transport by land 2. killing for disease control (as per scope) 3. humane slaughter (as per scope) 4. transport by sea; see Appendix V for scope and terms of reference	2003 2003 2004 2004
Expertise database	Identification of possible expertise (centres of expertise and individual experts)	Initial information from Working Group members by mid-November 2002
Animal welfare conference	Initial proposals from Drs Gavinelli, Rahman and Fraser re format, participants, outcomes - to include academia, research, funding, collaboration	Proposals to OIE by mid-December 2002; conference planned for second half 2003
Presentation at OIE General Session	Paper by member of Working Group and questions from Member Country Delegates	May 2003
Improved animal welfare awareness in teaching	Drs Bayvel, Masiga and Fraser to draft letter from OIE for veterinary schools; coordinate with WVA activities; Include issue in conference programme (Dr Gavinelli)	February 2003
Animal welfare research initiative	Drs Bayvel, Masiga and Fraser to provide input into conference programme (Dr Gavinelli) and text for OIE Web site, re research initiatives and associated funding needs	February 2003
Collaboration among academic and research institutions	Dr Fraser to provide input into conference programme (Dr Gavinelli)	February 2003
Communications plan	Working Group members to take up opportunities for publishing information articles in appropriate journals, Web pages and newsletters; Working Group members to utilise OIE Regional conferences, and other relevant conferences; OIE to develop slide show for Working Group members and other speaker use; Working Group members to provide stakeholder list for circulation of OIE information; Relationship with other international organisations involved in animal welfare activities to be communicated by OIE	continuing continuing mid November 2002 mid December 2002 mid December 2002
Future activities / emerging issues	Aquaculture animal welfare Animal biotechnology	Report from Professor T. Hastein for next meeting; Summary paper and perhaps presentation at 2003 conference

SCOPE, TERMS OF REFERENCE AND MEMBERSHIP OF *AD HOC* GROUPS**Transportation of animals used in agriculture and aquaculture**

Terms of reference for *Ad hoc* Groups dealing with transportation:

- First output – draft guiding principles (rather than a prescriptive approach to limits) specifically addressing transportation (based on the generic OIE guiding principles and policies for animal welfare)
- Final output – draft standards / guidelines for OIE *Code* based on approved guiding principles
- Review of existing standards in OIE *Code*
- Identification of future directions in which *Ad hoc* Group might need to move
- Produce drafts for review by Working Group and then by Code Commission
- Species to be covered
 - cattle, sheep, goats
 - pigs
 - poultry (including young chicks)
 - horses
 - other farmed ungulates, including deer and camelids *
 - fish *
 - ratites *

(* as resources permit and/or expertise is available)
- Modes of transport to be addressed
 - Air
 - Land
 - Sea

Air transport

The Working Group recommended that the OIE meet IATA/AATA to determine how to work together effectively.

- Species to be covered
 - cattle, sheep, goats
 - pigs
 - horses
- Likely expertise
 - IATA
 - AATA
- Working Group member as point of reference: Dr Gavinelli

Appendix XXII (contd)Appendix V (contd)**Land transport**

- Species to be covered
 - cattle, sheep, goats
 - pigs
 - poultry (including young chicks)
 - horses
- Likely expertise
 - Professor Don Broom (University of Cambridge, Madingley Road, Cambridge, UK)
 - Dr Caroline Stull (University of Davis, California, USA)
 - Lacombe Research Centre (Alberta, Canada)
 - Dr Lindsay Matthews (Animal Behaviour and Welfare Research Centre Ruakura, New Zealand)
 - Professor David Adams (Canberra, Australia)
 - Danish Meat Research Institute Maglegaardsvej, 2 DK-4000 Roskilde, Denmark
 - Institut für Tierhygiene und Tierschutz Tierärztliche Hannover, Germany
 - Roslin BioCentre, Midlothian EH25 9PS, UK
- Working Group member as point of reference: Dr Gavinelli

Sea transport

- Species to be covered
 - cattle, sheep, goats
 - pigs
 - horses
- Likely expertise
 - Professor Don Broom (Cambridge)
 - WA Dept of Agriculture (Perth)
 - Professor David Adams (Canberra)
 - Dr Ru David (NZ)
- Working Group member as point of reference: Dr Bayvel

Humane slaughter of animals used in agriculture and aquaculture

Terms of reference for *Ad hoc* Groups dealing with humane slaughter:

- First output – draft guiding principles (rather than a prescriptive approach to limits) specifically addressing humane slaughter, (based on the generic OIE guiding principles and policies for animal welfare)
- Final output – draft standards / guidelines for OIE *Code* based on approved guiding principles
- Identification of future directions in which *Ad hoc* Group might need to move
- Produce drafts for review by Working Group and then by Code Commission

Appendix XXII (contd)Appendix V (contd)

Focus on commercial scale slaughter

- Take account of religious and cultural dimensions through a sub-group examining these dimensions for cattle, sheep, goats and poultry and reporting to main *Ad hoc* Group
- Species to be covered
 - cattle, sheep, goats
 - pigs
 - poultry (including day-old chicks)
 - horses *
 - other farmed ungulates, including deer and camelids *
 - ratites *
 - rabbits *
 (* as resources permit and/or expertise is available)
- Likely expertise
 - School of Veterinary Science, University of Bristol, UK – NR/R
 - Institute for Animal Science and Health, Department of Behaviour, Stress Physiology and Management, Lelystad, Netherlands – NR
 - Dr Neville Gregory (Adelaide) – NR/R
 - Professor David Mellor, Animal Welfare Science and Bioethics Centre, Massey University, New Zealand) – NR
 - Dr Temple Grandin (Colorado) – NR/R
 - Regenstein (Cornell) – R and fish
 - A B Mohan Raj, University of Bristol, UK
 - Dr Muhammad Chaudry Islamic Food and Nutrition Council Chicago USA

NR non-religious slaughter

R religious slaughter

- Working Group member as point of reference: Dr Rahman

Killing for disease control of animals used in agriculture and aquacultureTerms of reference for *Ad hoc* Groups dealing with killing for disease control:

- First output – draft guiding principles (rather than a prescriptive approach to limits) specifically addressing killing for disease control, (based on the generic OIE guiding principles and policies for animal welfare)
- Final output – draft standards / guidelines for OIE *Code* based on approved guiding principles
- Identification of future directions in which *Ad hoc* Group might need to move
- Produce drafts for review by Working Group and then by Code Commission
- Take account of religious and cultural dimensions
- Give particular consideration to the needs of pregnant animals

Appendix XXII (contd)Appendix V (contd)

- Species to be covered
 - cattle, sheep, goats
 - pigs
 - poultry
 - horses *
 - other farmed ungulates, including deer and camelids *
 - ratites *
 - rabbits *
 - fish *(* as resources permit and/or expertise is available)

 - Expertise required for AHG
 - Lelystad (pigs)
 - BSI Schwarzenbek, Training and consultancy institute for careful handling of breeding and slaughter animals, Schwarzenbek, Germany
 - INRA, Station de Recherches sur la Viande, Centre de Clermont-Ferrand-Theix, Saint-Genes-Champanelle, France
 - Division of Food Animal Science, Department of Clinical Veterinary Science, University of Bristol, Langford Bristol, UK
 - Department of Laboratory Animal Science Lund University Lund, Sweden
 - Dr S Marangon, Istituto Zooprofilattico delle Venezie - Padova (birds)
 - Dr Norm Willis, Canada (carcase disposal)
 - Dr Craig Reed, USA (Virginia Polytechnic Institute)
 - DEFRA UK (cattle, sheep and goats)
 - Department Agriculture Victoria Australia (birds)
 - Semisi Fakahau Tonga (fish)

 - Working Group member as point of reference: Dr Gavinelli
-